



JAPAN  
BURMA  
HONG KONG  
KINA  
TAIWAN  
THAILAND  
BANGLADESH  
INDIA  
NEPAL  
PAKISTAN  
ISRAEL  
KENYA  
MOSAMBIQUE  
SWAZILAND  
SYD-AFRIKA

UGANDA  
REP. DU ZAIRE  
ARGENTINA  
BOLIVIA  
BRASIL  
CHILE  
HONDURAS  
PARAGUAY  
PERU  
BELGIA  
GRONLAND  
PORTUGAL  
SPANJA  
VEST-TYSKLAND

MISJONSSEKRETÆR  
REINERT O. INNVÆR

BOKS 25, ØKERN  
0508 OSLO 5,  
HARALDRUDVN. 5  
TELF. 42 34 00



**NORGE**

**PINSEVENNES YTRE MISJON**

## GUARANI INDIANS ON THE EVE OF INTEGRATION



### EVALUATION OF PYM'S DEVELOPMENT PROJECT AT PASO CADENA, PARAGUAY

Report to PYM (The Norwegian Pentecostal Mission) and NORAD,  
August 1988.

Jan-Åke Alvarsson  
Department of Cultural Anthropology  
University of Uppsala

Kristian Larsen  
Norwegian Missionary Alliance

**Jan-Åke Alvarsson**  
**Department of Cultural Anthropology**  
**University of Uppsala**

**Kristian Larsen**  
**Norwegian Missionary Alliance**

# **GUARANI INDIANS ON THE EVE OF INTEGRATION**

**EVALUATION OF PYM'S DEVELOPMENT PROJECT  
AT PASO CADENA, PARAGUAY**

**Report to PYM (The Norwegian Pentecostal Mission) and NORAD,  
August 1988.**

---

Cover by Jan-Åke Alvarsson

© Cultura Rediviva, Antropologkonsult i Uppsala AB

Printed in Uppsala, Sweden 1989

## GUARANI INDIANS ON THE EVE OF INTEGRATION

### EVALUATION OF PYM'S DEVELOPMENT PROJECT AT PASO CADENA, PARAGUAY

#### PREFACE

---

The following is an evaluation of the development project of the Norwegian Pentecostal Mission (PYM) among the Ava-Chiripá Indians of Paso Cadena, Paraguay. The evaluation was carried out in the month of August, 1988 by a team consisting of Jan-Åke Alvarsson, cultural anthropologist from the University of Uppsala, Sweden, Kristian Larsen, deacon from the Norwegian Missionary Alliance and Leonardo Alderete, a Paraguayan writer from Asunción. All three had experience from missionary work in Latin America and were acquainted with the work of the Norwegian Pentecostal Mission in Paraguay. None of the three is employed by or connected to this mission, however.

## **1. SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

The following is a brief summary of the conclusions and the recommendations of the evaluation team. Note that these are further explained in the text and that a more elaborate set of recommendations are presented in section 9.

### **1.1. Evaluative Remarks**

The team concluded that the PYM project at Paso Cadena has been initiated, supervised and developed by missionaries of a rather remarkable quality, especially in the question of attitudes and respect towards the indigenous population. This cultural relativistic attitude has created a trust among the target group that has been the primary base of all efforts up to this date, and that will remain a solid foundation for future missionary attempts by the mission. However, the team has decided to suggest the following alterations and additions to the present programme:

### **1.2. Overall Recommendations**

- \* The formation a pre-project committee that opens up a dialogue with the Ava-Chiripá leaders of Paso Cadena;
- \* The elaboration of project plans - including an outspoken and readily defined project strategy;
- \* The definition of the main target group, making clear that the Ava-Chiripá constitute the main target group (not excluding other categories);
- \* The engagement of especially devoted expatriate personell, contracted on a long-term basis.
- \* The promotion of immediate indigenization of the Paso Cadena project with the handing over of decision making to the Paso Cadena Indian community;
- \* The promotion of bilingual education that includes training in Guaraní as well as in Spanish.
- \* The extension of the present health care programme;

- \* The initiation of a training programme for elementary school teachers, assistant nurses and community development assistants at Paso Cadena;
- \* The boosting of the present consumption co-operative.
- \* The successive increase of fees for medicines until all patients pay the greater part of the costs of all current medicines.

## 2. INTRODUCTION

The Norwegian Pentecostal Mission (Pinsevevnenes Ytre Misjon, PYM) has received economic maintenance support from NORAD for the mentioned project since 1974. Because of this, NORAD has decided to demand a professional evaluation work on the project to be able to "decide whether a time limited support would make a localization of the project possible". PYM claims that there is still a continuous need of economic support for the project of Paso Cadena. These requirements led up to the creation of the mentioned evaluation team.

### 2.1. Work Description

The work description was defined as follows:

The team will visit the project at Paso Cadena. The crucial point of the whole project evaluation is the /possible/ nationalization of the project.---\* Project plans and project activities that are productive in a national context. \*Organizational development towards national structures and national decision processes. \* National supervision and direction of the economy. \* Personnel education towards national leadership. \* Personnel recruitment and professional training that ensures continuity of staff. When it comes to work among minority groups / as at Paso Cadena / the nationalization problem should be evaluated in the perspective of the limitations of the special situation of the group in the national society and the present national policy towards aboriginal populations". Furthermore, the team was encouraged to look at the following aspects: a) Evaluate the development of the project after, and in relation to, the evaluation work of the NORAD team of 1983. b) Look at the consequences of a mixed target group. c) Look at the project's socio-cultural consequences and its effects in relation to the specific needs of the target groups. d) Evaluate the form of ownership to the land in the target area. e) Strategy and main objectives of the health work in relation to the

national health policy as regards to Indian groups and the special socio-cultural qualifications and needs of the target group. f) Look at issues concerning staff and economy of the health project. g) Evaluate main objectives of the school work, target groups, curricula; teaching language, teaching material, and personnel in relation to economy and the socio-cultural background of each of the target groups.

## 2.2. Methodology.

The evaluation team used the following methodology to carry out its task:

- a) visit in the field at Paso Cadena \*
- b) interviews with local authorities and project staff \*
- c) contacts with national authorities in Asunción \*
- d) contacts with missionary representatives at Ypacarí, and \*
- e) bibliographical research. \*

Kristian Larsen arrived in the field the 6th of August 1988 and stayed in Paraguay until the 14th of August. Jan-Åke Alvarsson came to Asunción on the 9th of August and left the 17th. Leonardo Alderete participated in the evaluation team from the 8th to the 14th of the same month.

The team initiated its work in Ypacarí with a preparatory meeting with the missionaries of PYM (responsible for the work at Paso Cadena to the PYM in Norway). The second day, the team met with representatives of INDI (Instituto Nacional de Indígenas), the National Authority for Indigenous Affairs, in Asunción.

Thereafter, a three-days journey was made to Paso Cadena; the first day spent on the road, a full day at Paso Cadena, and the third day spent on the way back. At Paso Cadena we first visited the school, spoke to pupils of different ethnic backgrounds, as well as to all the teachers. Most of the time was spent in discussions with the woman headmaster of the school, Rosa Bogado de Garzete.

The rest of the morning was spent with one of the "líderes" (leaders) of the South settlement, señor Nicasio. In the afternoon we attended consultations at the health centre and then met with the "cacique" (main leader) of the Ava-Chiripá of Paso Cadena, Gabino Vera in the North section. Thereafter, we visited the "paí-guazu" (main shaman) of the group, paí Atanasio.

The night and the following morning was spent in conversation with Maximino Velázquez, the Paraguayan administrator at Paso Cadena.

The following day we visited the "Asociación Indígenista del Paraguay" (The Indian Association of Paraguay) and the Misión de Amistad (The Friend's Mission) in Asunción and the afternoon was spent in a meeting with the Norwegian missionaries at Ypacarí.

The report was written in joint co-operation between Jan-Åke Alvarsson and Kristian Larsen after a revision of the conclusions together with Leonardo Alderete. The opinions expressed in the report are shared by all the team-members, unless otherwise stated.

The evaluation report was discussed with representatives of PYM at a seminar in Oslo, October 14th 1988. It was again ventilated at an informal meeting with PYM representatives in Oslo, January 27th 1989.

### 3. BACKGROUND

#### 3.1. Ethnic Groups of Paraguay.

In Paraguay there are four main linguistic families among the Indians: the Zamucoan, the Macro-Guaicuruan, the Arawak and the Tupi-Guaraní. Usually, these are divided into 17 or 18 ethno-linguistic groups, comprising some 38,000-55,000 individuals. The variation of the figures is due to the uncertainty of the estimations. The figures of the first official census of the indigenous population of Paraguay (INDI, 1982), presented below, are most often criticized for under-estimating the numbers, due to insufficient coverage of the indigenous population. Several anthropologists have estimated that the real population figures are 30-40% higher than the official ones.

Table 1. Population of Ethnic Groups in Paraguay.

(Source: INDI 1982)

a) *Zamucoan*

Ayoreo	1,120
Chamacoco	963

b) *Macro-Guaicuruan*

Manjuy (Chorote)	319
------------------	-----



Chulupi	6,667
Mak'á	608
Tapieté	1,024
Toba Mascoy	1,280
Toba Qom	572
Lengua	8,121
Angaité	2,060
Sanapaná	1,794

*Det er meget påkrævet  
at være mispouceres  
på legges så (ere) seeg  
Guaraní - for å kunne  
drive virksomhet i Paraguay -*

c) *Arawak*

Guaná	383
-------	-----

d) *Tupi Guaraní*

Guarayu	1,464
Pai Tavytera	4,986
Mbyá	2,460
Aché	377
Ava-Chiripá	4,500

**TOTAL: 38,698**

(In addition to these, there are some 3,000,000 native speakers of Paraguayan Guaraní, but these are mostly of Mestizo origin.)

The ethnic group represented at Paso Cadena is Ava-Chiripá of the Tupi-Guaraní linguistic family. The dialect spoken at Paso Cadena is only slightly different from Paraguayan Guaraní and speakers of the latter language do not have any notable problems in conversations with the Ava-Chiripá.

### 3.2. Environment

**P**aso Cadena is situated on the Acaray river in the eastern part of Paraguay, at about the same latitude as Asunción. It is often associated with the region of Alto Paraná (Upper Paraná) but officially it belongs to the department of Caaguazú.

Traditionally, Paso Cadena was situated in the rain forest that covered most of the Alto Paraná region. Today, almost all of the rain forest has vanished and the land has been transformed into thicket, bushland or cultivated fields.

The deforestation seems to have changed the climate, and, as a proof of that, Paso Cadena suffered a severe drought at the time of our visit - something unheard of in bygone days.

The colonization of the region has meant the successive extinction of almost all wild animals. Today, some peccaries may roam through the forest at Paso Cadena at times; a deer can be seen occasionally; but other big game are not found there anymore.

### 3.3. Local History.

Paso Cadena is a traditional village site of the Ava-Chiripá. It also played an important role in the political mobilization of this group in the 60's. The supreme chief of the Ava-Chiripá of that time, Juan Pablo Vera, was the "cacique" of Paso Cadena. He has now retired, but still lives there. (His nephew is the present cacique).

"La penetración pacífica de los brasileños" (The Pacific Penetration of the Brazilians), as the Paraguayans call it, has increasingly affected Ava-Chiripá territory. The Brazilians migrate over to Paraguay, buy land, establish farms, but maintain Brazilian citizenship and customs. They continue to speak Portuguese and to sell their produce in Brazil.

Their expansive attitude constitutes a severe threat to the Indians. Simultaneously, land has become more valuable in the whole of Paraguay. A great number of Paraguayans have moved into the Ava-Chiripá territory. This colonization has resulted in the successive loss of land. It is estimated that the Ava-Chiripá in the 60's possessed some 2,000 hectares and that they now have less than half of that, or 974 hectares in total (734 hectares in the North settlement and 240 hectares in the South).

Another effect of the colonization is that the Ava-Chiripá have become increasingly dependent on cash work. They work as day-labourers at the farms of the Brazilians and the Paraguayans to get cash. With the increasing influence of Paraguayan culture, they need more and more cash to buy clothes, maté (Paraguayan herb tea) and other types of consumer's goods. Some of the Ava-Chiripá have been "trapped" in cash labour and have been forced to give up agriculture because of lack of time.

With the help of the PYM missionaries, the Ava-Chiripá of Paso Cadena received legal rights to their land in July 1986.

### 3.4. The Socio-Economic Organization of the Ava-Chiripá.

The Ava-Chiripá live in extensive, scattered settlements, where the houses often are out of sight of each other. At Paso Cadena there are two such settlements, the South settlement (the smaller one) and the North (the larger one). In each unit there is an extended family that forms a household, traditionally called the *ty'y*. The household is the basic economic unit of the Ava-Chiripá. It is used for the socio-economic organization of the family's activities, especially those concerning the cultivation of the land around its settlement.

Traditionally, the Ava-Chiripá were migrating hunters and gatherers with some slash-and burn cultivation. Bows and arrows were the original hunting weapons. Nowadays, with the successive eradication of the rain forest and the lack of cultivable land, migration is no longer possible. The Ava-Chiripá have been forced to become sedentary peasants. However, the agricultural technique has changed very little and they still maintain the slash-and-burn cultivation. They fell the trees, burn the thicket, open the earth with a digging stick and drop a few grains of maize into the hole.

Today they also plant cassava, sweet potatoes, sugar cane, bananas, peanuts and different kinds of beans. Some families have tried cotton as a cash-crop, but have found it hazardous. A little drought will finish off the whole investment.

There is very little fish left in the Acaray river. As stated above, the big game is all but extinct. Thus hunting and fishing have lost their importance in present day Ava-Chiripá economy. There is still some honey to be gathered in the woods but tree- fruits are no longer found. Thus women never leave their homes to go gathering, and the men rarely go hunting, fishing or foraging. Agriculture or cash work take up all their time.

The Ava-Chiripá society is not stratified. Nevertheless, there are both sub-chiefs ("líderes") and a chief ("cacique") in each settlement, mainly due to the INDI indigenous policy. Apart from the chiefs, who control the political power, there are also shamans (*paí*) who exert a considerable influence over the group. The *paí* is a counsellor, a priest and a physician at the same time. Thus, he has an informal authority that is considerable.

#### 4. THE PYM DEVELOPMENT PROJECT OF PASO CADENA.

The Norwegian missionary work at Paso Cadena was initiated in 1959 when three women missionaries, Bergjot Nordmoen, Gunvor Johansen and Ruth Kjellås started social and evangelical work in the Ava-Chiripá community. The work was carried out in co-ordination with and under the supervision of the missionaries in Asunción. Some years later, the Paso Cadena mission acquired a more independent status with its autonomous jurisdiction under the name of *Betania*. This was the administrative organization until 1967 when *Misión NORMA* was founded and then comprised the whole missionary work of PYM in Paraguay (with its centre in Ypacarí).

Several Norwegian missionary families have been working at Paso Cadena. The last one was Mr. and Mrs. Rudolf Larsen who left in 1987. Today, there is a Paraguayan administrator at the place, Maximino Velázquez. He has worked at Paso Cadena since the beginning of 1987.

The development project has comprised land rights, school work, health care and agriculture. Besides, there has been some evangelical work.

##### 4.1. Land Rights.

In the beginning of the 60's the mission initiated the struggle for official recognition of the Ava-Chiripá's land rights at Paso Cadena. First, the land was given to the mission, but the ultimate intention, that the Indians should have their own land rights documented, was not achieved until a new Indian Law was passed and new institutions that worked with indigenous land rights had been created. At last, in 1986, the bureaucratic process was finished and the land rights were granted.

In 1987 the documents of the Indians' possession of 974 hectares of land were handed over to the community of Paso Cadena. According to the rules of INDI, the Indians own their land as communal property with individual rights to a certain section as long as it is occupied by the family in question. Individual families cannot sell or otherwise dispose of their portion of the land.

## 4.2. School Work

The missionaries started school work among the Ava-Chiripá in the 60's, but many years passed before the school was nationalized and recognized by the local authorities. It is now a Paraguayan "grade school" and thus receives economic support from the Ministry of Education for the teachers' salaries. This also means that the curriculum is the national Paraguayan one, elaborated in an urban, Hispanicized environment, minimally adapted to the local conditions of Paso Cadena.

In 1986 a new school complex with three buildings was inaugurated. The buildings comprised five classrooms of 42 sqm each, as well as an office. The school was financed entirely by the mission through "Aksjon Håp" in Norway.

When we visited the school at Paso Cadena, 140 children were registered as pupils. These were divided into two 1st grades, two 2nd grades, one 3 + 4th grade and one 5 + 6th grade. Some groups were taught in the morning, others in the afternoon. In total, there were five class teachers and one handicraft teacher. All of them spoke Guaraní as their first or second language. They were all bilingual.

PYM has concentrated most of its work to the indigenous group of the region, the Ava-Chiripá. Ever since the start, Mestizos and Whites (Creoles) have also been target groups, but to a lesser extent than the former. This has caused problems at school, as there have been pupils of different linguistic origin: Spanish, Guaraní, Portuguese and German are the mother tongues represented at the Paso Cadena school. At our visit the non-Guaraní section was very small, however. Out of the 140 pupils, 80 were Guaraní-speaking Ava-Chiripá, only 2 spoke German at home, and the rest were bilingual (Spanish/Guaraní) Mestizo.

Consequently, the teachers have used both Spanish and Guaraní when teaching, at times even employing the Portuguese most of them know, but the books and the school material are all in Spanish.

There are Bible classes one hour a week, held by one of the regular teachers. Out of all the pupils registered, only some 6 - 7 finish 6th grade every year, and even fewer continue at the college (colegio) 24 kilometres away. One of the obstacles is the cost of room and board at the village where the college is located.

### 4.3. Health Care

The health centre at Paso Cadena is located just opposite the mission's residential area. It is a small clinic, consisting of two wooden houses, 80 and 50 sqm respectively. One of them houses the clinic, a storage room and a room where patients, or relatives, may spend the night. The other serves as a residence for project personnel.

There has been no Norwegian personnel at Paso Cadena since 1987. The administrator, Maximino Velázquez, is at present also the auxiliary nurse at the clinic. Mr. Velázquez has a very limited education: two one week-courses for auxiliary nurses in Asunción and six months experience of co-operation with the Norwegian missionary Rudolf Larsen at Paso Cadena. Besides, he can make very little use of the case-books - they are written in Norwegian!

At the clinic, Indian patients pay 100 G (US\$ 0,1), and Mestizo patients pay 200 G (US\$ 0,2) for consultation. The former pay up to 30% of the medicine cost (if medicine is available), while the latter pay 100%. 3,200 patients a year are attended at the clinic. Of these, 60 - 70 are remitted to the hospitals of Atakyri (small) or Puerto Presidente Stroessner (large) (PPS is a large city on the border to Brazil).

Mr. Velázquez' wife gives assistance at deliveries, usually in the home of the patients. She speaks Guaraní as her first language and therefore she has no problems in communicating with the Ava-Chiripá. There is also a male Ava-Chiripá who assists at deliveries, but as far as we could assess, there was no contact between this male midwife and the mission.

There has been little health education at Paso Cadena. Mr. Velázquez has held two short courses, one in each village section, about preventive medicine and sanitary problems. Besides, he is counselling his patients while attending them, encouraging them to boil the water, give liquid to children with diarrhoea, etc.

According to Velázquez, and other informants, the most common diseases in the area are diarrhoea, malaria, tuberculosis and infectious problems. Most of the affected people go to the mission with readily identifiable (somatic) diseases, while they recur to the shamans (*paí*) if Occidental medicine fails or produces little result, or if they are plagued by psycho-somatic illnesses. "Hay enfermedades que sólo el *paí* puede curar" ("There are illnesses that only the shaman can cure"), said one of our informants.

In the NORAD report (1983:119) it is stated that "the traditional healers (Pai shaman) play an important part with their efficient treatments of psy-



chosomal illness and their use of plants and herbs for a variety of illnesses". Today, the importance of the shamans is still considerable and the interest is not decreasing, on the contrary, it seems to be increasing as part of the reinforcement of the Ava-Chiripá cultural identity. The problem is, however, that today few shamans are readily acknowledged by the people. At Paso Cadena only one *paí* (shaman) is considered to be "a real shaman", i.e. a counsellor, a healer and a priest at the same time. The others are considered to be inferior and "incomplete". Thus, the inhabitants of Paso Cadena would very much like to have shamans to go to, but consider that there are but one worth recurring to.

#### 4.4. Agriculture

PYM has never launched any large agricultural project at Paso Cadena, as they did at Yby-Ya (Eben Ezer). Instead, they concentrated their efforts at the promotion of land rights (see above). They have supplied seeds, tools (machete) and chickens. As a form of payment, the Ava-Chiripá have had to give back part of the harvest (some 50% of the real value). One tool - a type of planting machine, used for planting maize, is quicker than the traditional method - a man and a woman collaborating - and requires only one person. The results are not as good, however. When a dry spell hits the area, as this year, the hand-planted seeds sprout, as they are placed deeper down into the soil where there is more humidity, while the machine-planted dry out and die.

#### 4.5. Evangelical work

At Paso Cadena, PYM has employed a slightly different approach to the missionary enterprise than in e.g. Argentina. The overall missionary strategy there is to limit missionary activities to "purely spiritual work", establishing "annexes" from given geographical locations, most often towns or cities of importance. At Paso Cadena, the evangelizing activities have been more moderate and the attitude towards the Indians more respectful.

Still, we may identify the three basic components that characterize the work also in Argentina:

- \* a) **preaching and counselling** (in Spanish and Guaraní)
- \* b) **health care** (nursing and some health education)
- \* c) **handing out of gifts** (used clothes and some monetary aid).

As in Argentina, the last area of work has diminished notably in importance over the last few years, and for two reasons: the mission economy is comparatively poorer today than in the 50's and the 60's; and experience has shown that handing out gifts without demanding anything in return is corruptive rather than productive.

However, in contrast to the work in the neighbouring country, a fourth component may be identified in PYM's work in Paraguay:

- \* d) **community development** (school work, agriculture, land rights, etc.)

This part of the work has been characterized by a notable respect for individuals and their cultural heritage (cf. NORAD Report 1983:115). The "cultural relativistic" approach and the change in mission strategy (focussing on support of autochthonous initiatives rather than traditional "aid") may have combined in producing the overall "meagre" results of the evangelical work. At Paso Cadena there are two churches, one at the mission and one at the north settlement, but only one of them was in use at our visit and only a handful "believers" attended the church in function.

Evaluating the project from a traditional fundamentalist point of view, another fact may also weaken the impression: the traditional religion is still very vigorous. The shamans exert a strong influence in the society, religious ceremonies are held regularly, many young people attend the traditional rituals and Ava-Chiripá religion constitute an important element in the present revitalization of their ethnic identity.

This conclusion - that the spiritual work has "failed" - may have caused the successive "disarmament" of the work at Paso Cadena. The cut in mission activities is not explicitly stated anywhere, but a mere visit to the place is sufficient: there are two good missionary houses and no expatriate co-workers - even though the need of external help is unchanged; no development activity is functioning (except for limited, isolated activities); and there is not a single person who dedicates full time to spiritual work.

Paso Cadena received very moderate criticism in the NORAD '83 report, in contrast to the work at Eben Ezer. A Paraguayan journalist wrote a very critical essay on the work some years ago, but his conclusions could easily have been contradicted and I am sure that the article reached very few peop-



le in Norway. Therefore, we can find no reason for reductions in external criticism; (except for a possible confusion of the results concerning Paso Cadena and the negative ones for Yby Yaú). The answer is therefore most probably found in the implicit, internal and informal evaluations of the work by the mission itself.

The conclusion that the spiritual work at Paso Cadena has "failed" is based on too superficial assessments, however. As is obvious from the next section, the results obtained in Paso Cadena probably surpasses the "success" of PYM's work in northern Argentina.

## 5. EVALUATION OF THE PROJECT

The present section is an attempt to synthesize the team's opinions of the project at Paso Cadena, considering the resources, needs and priorities of the different parties involved (target group, missionaries, authorities and others).

### 5.1. General Conclusions

On the whole, the team considered the Paso Cadena project to be a good attempt at creating a cultural relativistic mission for the Ava Chiripá. The missionaries have not been as ethnocentric or religiocentric as is usually the case in similar projects, nor have they introduced too many Western, acculturative devices. Nevertheless, the team made the following observations:

### 5.2. Occurences After the NORAD Evaluation of 1983

After the evaluative visit of the NORAD team in 1983, the PYM board in Oslo declared that they would present an overall project plan for the work at Paso Cadena. *This has not yet been fulfilled, however, and the project still lacks an overall strategy for its work.*

Some other things were noted as well:

a) When NORAD demanded the present evaluation, they were interested in assessing whether "a limited, continued support will make 'localization' of the project possible" (in Norwegian: "om tidsbegrenset fortsatt støtte, vil kunne muliggjøre lokalisering av prosjektet; Work Description p.1.). When PYM passes on the task to the evaluation team, the word 'localization' (in English, read: 'indigenization') is lost, however, and only the word 'nationalization' is used.

From the Work Description, as well as from our experiences in the field, it has become apparent that PYM (or Misión NORMA) has planned for nationalization of the Paso Cadena project, disregarding the directions from NORAD, to investigate localization - or rather - indigenization of the project. Therefore, the evaluation team insists that the paragraph on 'indigenization' below is of utmost importance to the final outcome of the project, and therefore must be considered in all instances of planning.

b) When PYM claims to have fulfilled intentions in the NORAD Report of 1983, having arrived at "nationalization" of Paso Cadena (see Work Description, p. 1), we believe that this is in fact evidence of a misunderstanding between PYM and NORAD. As we show below, the project at Paso Cadena is nominally "nationalized", but in no way indigenized.

c) In the years that have passed since 1983, only one point on the NORAD wanted list may be said to have been successfully concluded, and that is the question of land rights (see a more explicit paragraph below). The Ava-Chiripá Indians of Paso Cadena now have legal rights to the land they live on.

d) In the area of medical services and health care, little has happened. As we state below, nationalization has not meant improvement - rather impoverishment.

e) As regards seed-corn, something has been accomplished, but there are, most certainly, more things that can be done.

f) When it comes to the school, the new buildings, inaugurated in 1986, have added to the technical standard of the school; otherwise, little, or nothing, has been done to improve the schooling for the Ava-Chiripá, as suggested in the NORAD report.

g) Finally, no contacts have been taken with the Proyecto Guaraní, as was suggested in the NORAD report. The reasons for this seems to have mainly ideological. Proyecto Guaraní was seen as a quasi-political and, on the whole, anti-missionary organization and therefore it was deemed counter-productive to engage in any kind of co-operation with them. It is obvious that the NORAD evaluation, basically positive towards the Paso Cadena project, has influenced the project plans in anything but marginal matters.

### 5.3. The Aim of the Paso Cadena Project

At the moment, the project lacks an overall plan for the future. The resources, needs and priorities of the different parties involved are not explicitly defined. There are no outspoken goals of the work. In part, this may be due to the confusion about the results that characterizes the present project management. In part, it may also be ascribed to the delicacy of mission work among Indian groups, especially after the evaluation report of 1983.

#### **5.4. The Target Group of the Project**

In theory, it has been repeatedly stated, ultimately in the Work Description, page 1., that the Indians constitute the main target group of the project ("Prosjektet i Paso Cadena har indianerne som hovedmålgruppe"). In practice, this is more debatable, however, as it is not explicitly made clear at Paso Cadena, neither to the project personnel, nor to the Indians, that this is the case. In everyday project activities, there is today a mixed target group, consisting of Indians, Paraguayan Mestizos and Brazilian immigrants.

#### **5.5. The PYM Project Strategy**

PYM has given priority to work among the indigenous groups of the region, in Argentina as well as in Paraguay. This may be justified for two reasons: first, the historical fact that PYM has worked among the Indians for several decades, and, second, because of the present situation of the Indians in a society in rapid social change. The Indian groups in question are in need of external help when mercilessly confronted with the national society that is unable to understand them and their specific needs. In comparison to the national authorities, the mission workers have been more dedicated, more affectionate and more understanding.

Lately, the project strategy has been more blurred, however. This may be due to the increased influence of Paraguayan Mestizos who advocate integration and an indiscriminate "aid to the poorest", disregarding race. It may also be attributed to the delicacy of missionary work amongst Indian groups, as stated above. Today, the project needs a redefinition of its strategy as well as of its general aim.

#### **5.6. The Effects of a Mixed Target Group**

In the beginning, and, nominally, still in 1988 (see 5.4. above) the Ava-Chiripá Indians have constituted the target group at Paso Cadena. In the eyes of the authorities (INDI), the missionaries and the donors in Norway, Paso Cadena has been associated with work among "Indians" (in the latter case, most certainly typical dry forest Guaraní Indians).

During the last decade, the increasing percentage of non-Indians in the area has caused a successive alteration of the work at Paso Cadena. From the start, the Paraguayan Mestizos were welcome to the clinic (and later the school)

at Paso Cadena. In those days, the Mestizos were so few, however, that the cultural influx they brought about was marginal. (Instead, their visits most probably meant a "break" in the quotidian attentions for the missionaries who spoke little, or no, Guaraní.

Today, half of the population of the area consists of Mestizos (Bjorklund 1988:33). This has led to a severely altered situation for the Ava-Chiripá. The acculturative forces have increased, as have the pressures on the Indians to integrate into the national Paraguayan society.

At Paso Cadena, the changed conditions have led to a confusion about the explicit goals /and target groups/ of the mission. The Ava-Chiripá feel marginalized because of the increasing numbers of Mestizos attended at the clinic, and educated at school, and because of the uncertainty of their own /project/ status, they may refrain from utilizing the services of the mission. The reasons behind the admittance of the Mestizos may have been laudable in the beginning, but at present the effects of a mixed target group (or rather, the confusion about the delimitation of this category) are nothing but negative for the original target group, the Ava-Chiripá. The Indians feel set aside, feel uncertain about their rights and status. If this goes on, they will most probably leave all project activities as they feel discriminated and disregarded by the Mestizos, within and without the project.

The only solution to this crux is to resume the original ideological intention - to have the Indians as the target group. If this be the case, the Ava-Chiripá will again feel at home at Paso Cadena, they will get the necessary support for the revival (and/or maintenance) of their ethnic identity and they will be able to resist the derisive sneers of the Mestizos.

This will not exclude the Mestizos from the school, nor from the clinic, however. It will only signify that they will have to adapt to the Indian's programme, instead of the opposite (which is always the case at present in Paraguayan society). As stated elsewhere in this report, the needs of the Mestizos are not fundamentally different to those of the Ava-Chiripá - but the psychological effects of any such alteration are notable!

### **5.7. Project Effects in Relation to the Needs**

The present project organization and project strategies are not the ones that would have been advocated or suggested by the Indians. Their needs are quite different to those considered in the present programmes. With the

sole exceptions of the struggle for land rights and some medical care, the Indians do not identify with the various project goals as they look today.

As long as the school only considers Paraguayan Mestizo ideals (pronounced in the official curriculum used at school; evident in the predominance of the non-Indian official language as the working language at school), it is not feasible to think that the Ava-Chiripá would associate with any school ideals - and, as school work takes time from ordinary, everyday activities, it is not to wonder that most Indian pupils become drop-outs before they reach third grade.

In the case of the neighbouring Mestizos, those officially outside the project, almost all activities (with the exception of the struggle for Indian land rights) have been helpful in developing the national (Westernized) values. This is true for the school, the economic programmes, the clinic, etc. (if it were not for the Indians, this would have been a most successful project in their eyes). Thus, the Mestizos have possibly benefitted more from the project than the Indians.

In the long run though, (but possibly seen in a Westernized perspective with a predominant, urban, male bias - something we all tried to avoid, however), there may be decisive effects of the programmes also for the Ava-Chiripá (although they do not appreciate them at the moment). Knowledge of Paraguayan society, the ability to speak Spanish, the faculties of being able to read, write and count, certain health care (such as vaccinations), may all prove to be crucial assets when the Ava-Chiripá are drawn closer to mainstream Paraguay.

### **5.8. Socio-Cultural Effects of the Project**

The project has generated positive as well as negative socio-cultural effects for both the Ava-Chiripá and the Mestizos in the region. The most tangible and fundamental result for the Indians has been the acquisition of legal rights to [some of] their traditional land. Ensured socio-political and judicial rights, have also been of utmost importance to them.

A psychological side-effect of the project is not to be forgotten: the intimate association with the Whites from Europe has signified an increased status position for the Indians, in the eyes of the Mestizos, incredibly fundamental in the delicate position of non-Mestizos in the Paraguayan countryside.

The negative effects of the school, i.e. decreasing time for traditional enculturative activities and the spreading of contradictory values, in combina-

tion with the side-effects of the clinic, i.e. the challenging of the traditional medical authorities, have been most threatening to Ava-Chiripá culture during the decades of missionary activity at Paso Cadena.

As the missionaries have displayed an unusually cultural relativistic attitude, also in matters of religion (something extra-ordinary and thus especially laudable) these effects are mitigated somewhat. Through their work for land rights and attention to human rights, they have made possible an autochthonous development of Ava-Chiripá culture, carried out in greater cultural freedom than had otherwise been the case. (In a longer perspective the possible positive effects of the school and the clinic, mentioned above, might also be included here.)

For the Mestizos, the Norwegian mission has meant cultural as well as economic support. The indirect economic aid, through school subsidies and reduced attention fees at the clinic, has been most welcome at a critical stage of the Mestizo colonists in the area. Furthermore, their association with the Whites, representing the highest cultural standard in their world view, has meant cultural reinforcement for them as well. (The most incomprehensible trait in the mission's work, in the eyes of the Mestizos, has of course been the priority given to the Ava-Chiripá - the ones least qualified for attention. The only justifiable reason for work amongst the Indians, would, according to them, be to facilitate and speed up the integration of the Ava-Chiripá into the national society).



## 6. EVALUATION OF THE SEPARATE PROGRAMMES

### 6.1. PYM's Work for Land Rights

We consider PYM's continuous work for Indian land rights to be laudable. This is the most basic effort of any development project among indigenous peoples and in this respect it may be claimed that PYM has "saved" the traditional settlement of Paso Cadena. Without the mission's labour the outcome would have been most uncertain - especially during the present Brazilian penetration.

As the Indians have received their land rights, in the form of collective proprietorship with individual possessions, this part of the project may be said to have been *concluded very successfully!* No future aid is deemed necessary as the community council takes care of the legal aspects of the proprietorship.

### 6.2. PYM's School Work

The physical facilities at Paso Cadena are excellent for their purpose. The school buildings are clean, open, light and very appropriate. There is no need for any further extension in that area at the moment.

The teachers are good; they are professionals, most of them; they all understand and speak Guaraní; they have a fairly positive attitude towards the indigenous pupils. They can, in no way, replace indigenous teachers, however. None of them is an Ava-Chiripá, and it is precisely Ava-Chiripá teachers that are needed to counteract the drop-out tendencies, so prevalent today.

Therefore, the school would need Ava-Chiripá teachers of two categories. First, the initiation into school activities would be easier if the beginners encountered Indian teachers in the first grades. Second, an adaptation of the curriculum would imply teachers of Ava-Chiripá origin, with recognized cultural competence, to teach the subjects relating to Ava-Chiripá technology, cosmology and the like. (See further recommendations, below).

Today, the pupils have a possibility to continue their studies in Atakyri. Before they reach a higher degree of confidence, feel better acquainted with the basic principles of school work, and have an active support from the community, however, it will be continuously difficult to give them a higher education. The changes must start in the community, at the Paso Cadena school.



### 6.3. Medical Service and Health Care

According to our impression, the intentions of the medical service and the health care is to give first aid and economic support (in the form of medicines and transportation) to the Ava-Chiripá, without closing the door for the Mestizos. This is a notable reduction in medical service compared to the era of Norwegian nurses and midwives at Paso Cadena - but the team considers the present level to be far more adequate - especially as the infrastructure (roads, clinics, hospitals) of the region has improved notably during the last few years.

The strategy of the medical service was originally simple and straightforward: clinic-based attention and activities in a quasi-European programme. The clinic, and the activities performed there, were most hospital-like. Today, the strategy is altered somewhat. The programme is still mainly clinic-based, but there are other activities as well, notably the transportation to hospitals.

The clinic premises at Paso Cadena are simple, i.e. the buildings are of a low standard. They are sufficiently well equipped for their purpose, however, and there is no immediate need for new constructions. The mission car is a pickup, most adequate for the needs of the patients.

The nursing provided today seems to be fairly adequate in a local as well as in a national perspective. Mr. Velázquez, in co-operation with his wife, the traditional *paí*, the traditional [male] midwife (see above), provide a care of the sick that surpasses most rural areas in Paraguay. Furthermore, Velázquez provides transportation to the local (Atakyri) and regional (PPStroessner) hospitals, which improves this situation even further.

The clinic provides first aid and treatment of current diseases, such as bronchitis, infections of the stomach and the intestines and medication against tuberculosis, according to the national health policy. The transportation of patients to clinics and hospitals is a very important complement to this care.

The patients at the clinic receive a care that is very similar in kind and quality to that provided by state clinics in most parts of Paraguay. National health policy follows the same pattern: training of a local to become a kind of health promotor, but working mainly in the field of curative medicine. The team therefore considers that the work at Paso Cadena has reached a position that is satisfying in a national context (and that aligns well with that proposed by INDI), but that needs a fundamentally different approach if it is to

improve the general health of the population; (for a suggested health programme, see below).

As stated above, the Indians pay a nominal fee (US\$ 0,1) for attention at the clinic but receive medicine for free. The Mestizos pay a double fee for attention (a fee that is still very moderate, 0,2 US\$) and up to 30% of the cost of the medicine. The Indians also have access to free transportation to the nearby hospital in the mission's car, while the Mestizos are obliged to take the bus (Bjorklund 1988:33).

But if the medical attention is adequate, according to the team's assessment, appropriate health care is deficient. There are vaccination campaigns at times, but these could be better organized and administered, and, above all, more regular. The most important element, hygiene and health education, is also far too overlooked. We would wish to see:

- (a) village courses in hygiene,
- (b) education of Indian "barefoot nurses", and
- (c) health education at the children's school.

The mission states that two present holders of [mission] scholarships, two Paraguayan [Mestizo] women, will be available as nurses at Paso Cadena next year. This seems to be a reasonable possibility to expand the health work there in a short-term perspective, according to the plans indicated. (For suggested long term activities, see 7.1. below, however).

#### 6.4. PYM's Engagement in Agriculture

The basic condition for agriculture is land and PYM has provided land rights for the Ava-Chiripá of Paso Cadena. They have also engaged in the provision of tools and seeds. We consider that the efforts have been appropriate, in view of the resources and the conditions of the project. It would have been unwise to launch a large agricultural project, like the one at Eben Ezer, without previous investigation.

Today, Mr. Velázquez also promotes the idea of poultry rearing by breeding chickens at home and talking about it at home visits, and some of the leading Ava-Chiripá families seem to respond to the challenge. There is still more to be done, however, and a visit to the Paí-Tavytera of Eben Ezer, studying their local solutions to pig corrals and the like should be an encouragement.

After our visit, there have been incentives to launch a consumption cooperative, in the main a store - something that is evidently a success (Bjorklund 1988:35). The administrator goes to the city (PPStroessner) each week to buy groceries and other types of consumer's goods and these are then sold cash to Indians of the colony. The Indians buy - and pay for the goods acquired (ibid).

We (Alvarsson/Larsen) consider this to be a good start for possible economic cooperation also when it comes to production cooperatives. It must be emphasized that the *ty'y* (see 3.4.) should be the natural economic unit for cooperatives and that it is of the right scale if one intends to launch cooperative programmes. It is not self-evident that a store, or a rice peeling machine should be owned by the community. In many cases, we believe, a single *ty'y* would be the natural owner.

### 6.5. Evangelical Work

According to the team's judgement, the evangelical work at Paso Cadena has been most appropriate and, from a traditionally evangelical point of view, successful. A superficial assessment may result in a contradictory statement (see above), but any conversation with the traditional leaders, as our own with the traditional *paí*, shows the enormous distance that the [Norwegian and Paraguayan] missionaries have covered in their efforts to promote a positive attitude towards Evangelical Christianity.

"*Todos invocamos a un solo Dios*" ("We all worship one and the same God"), said the *paí* at our interview, when asked about his opinion of the missionaries' spiritual work. Others professed their confidence in the missionaries even more directly.

It is obvious that the [Norwegian and Paraguayan] missionaries, through their dedicated efforts over the years, and in combination with their apparent respect for the Ava-Chiripá traditional values, have attained a trust that by far supasses the superficial response that is easily achieved through the handing out of clothes, goods and the like. Therefore, if the Ava-Chiripá, in connection with the rapid social change in the area, would choose to align themselves with another confession, they would most certainly choose the one represented at the mission.

It is important to note that the present Ava-Chiripá religious activity constitutes a very important part of their ethnic identity. The maintenance of this identity is of utmost importance whatever the future will be like and wherever the Ava-Chiripá society is heading. Therefore, the PYM efforts to re-

spect the "Indian way" is essential in this context. Any future religious denomination among them must be an "Ava-Chiripá church", with its own characteristics, if the ethnic identity, and with it, the possibilities of surviving as a people in Paraguayan society, shall live on.

A strategic "ethnic" choice of religious alignment would also imply a manifestation as regards cultural affiliation. In that context, the Ava-Chiripá would not choose to align with the Catholic church as it represents the national, non-Ava-Chiripá, society, the [economically and thus] culturally superior and thus threatening their [cultural] autonomy.

## 7. NATIONALIZATION AND INDIGENOUS GROUPS

The aspects of nationalization of foreign-supported development projects have received much attention the last few years. Nationalization of projects among ethnic minority groups has been less discussed although it is much more complicated.

First, "nationalization" is a blurry word in this context. Generally, it means that national personnel has taken over all positions in the project. /The latter may still be partially financed from the exterior/. In the mentioned context, that of indigenous groups, or ethnic minorities, we must define the situation - and especially the actors - more closely.

In all situations involving ethnic minorities we must identify (at least) three categories of actors: the receivers [representatives of the ethnic minority], the "gatekeepers" [i.e. the national authorities, representing the national culture, language and state organization] and the *donors* [representatives from the foreign nation providing help].

In this context, the "nationalization" concept must be redefined. Usually, it implies "all positions nationalized", disregarding ethnic background. In the case of ethnic minorities, this is no longer possible. Here, ethnicity plays an important role. Competition, and/or oppression, usually complicates the situation to the extent that co-operation may be possible between donors and receivers, but not between receivers and gatekeepers. Therefore, a development project may progress according to the planned schedule as long as there is expatriate personnel, but cease to do so the moment it is "nationalized", i.e. turned over to the gatekeepers.

The issue is therefore - is "nationalization" an appropriate concept when we refer to indigenous groups? Should we not rather talk about "indigenization" as the ultimate goal.

Second, we must distinguish between the goals of the three groups or categories involved. All three are interested in some kind of "progress" but they define the term differently. For the donors an outspoken goal may be "democratization" or "economic growth". For the gatekeepers, "integration" of the indigenous group may be the goal while the receivers see "independent" or "alternative" development as a goal. "Independent development" may e.g. mean strengthened economic means for cultural resistance, i.e. totally in opposition to what the gatekeepers want.

These conflicting goals must be considered when defining the "nationalization" or "indigenization" processes. They must also be included when setting the goals for development projects among ethnic minorities.

It is impossible to "indigenize" all positions in the lives of an ethnic minority group, There will always be superior positions like mayors, military officers, engineers, school officials, etc. that will be held by the gatekeepers. Therefore, it is most important in all projects concerning indigenous populations to stipulate the goals - also as regards the level of indigenization. In some groups, at a short cultural distance from the gatekeepers (e.g. the people of Estonia in relation to the national authorities of the Soviet Union), the goals may be set at a fairly high level, i. e. all positions in the hands of the receivers.

In the case of a people at a considerable cultural distance, both from the gatekeepers and the donors (such as the Amerindian Mataco of the Gran Chaco) certain positions such as college teachers and engineers must, for a considerable time space, be left to the gatekeepers (in the case of the Mataco, Spanish speaking Mestizo of Argentinian or Bolivian origin).

Therefore, a plan must be set up before the initiation of the project; a plan that specifies the positions that are considered necessary/possible to indigenize. Thereafter, an educational programme must be launched to provide the necessary education for all receivers that are thought to take over the indicated positions. Without such a programme, the realization of a community development project may be impossible - and it must be deemed unwise to launch it.

In the case of culturally distant peoples, education programmes must also be adapted to the local conditions. First, they may have to include alternative pedagogics as well as adapted curricula. Second, they must be over-sized as the percentage of drop-outs in an education programme of a distant cultural tradition, always is conspicuously high.

Such programmes naturally influence the time limits of the projects. It has been considered "ideal" to carry out development projects in three or four years - but in the case of distantly related cultures, this time must most probably be doubled. Altered time limits also imply higher costs - but this effect should be regarded as natural - and be projected from the start. It should not discourage any donors, however, especially if these experiences are more widespread than today.



## 7.1. Nationalization of the Project at Paso Cadena.

In the NORAD Evaluation Report of 1983 "nationalization" of the project in Paso Cadena was set up as one of the primary goals. This recommendation was not specifically formulated as "indigenization", however, and the problems as regards receivers vs. gatekeepers was not dealt with. (In the assignment by NORAD to evaluate the mission work in 1988, the term "localization" is used, however).

At Paso Cadena, the donors led the project up until recently. To their disposition they had several assistants and co-workers - most of them associated with the gatekeepers, however. At school, all positions were held by non-Indians, i.e. by Paraguayan Mestizos. At the clinic, the main assistant (and planned health project manager) was a Brazilian Mestizo (Grete Verdejo). The second assistant was a Guaraní Indian, however, the only one (according to the information we obtained at Paso Cadeña) employed in the project.

When the Norwegian expatriates were ready to leave, still another representative for the gatekeepers, Maximino Velásquez, (a Paraguayan Mestizo) was brought in as the future project manager. He was able to work in the project for six months before he was made leader of the project. Shortly after the Norwegian missionaries had left the project, the Brazilian nurse (Grete Verdejo) decided to leave it and Maximino Velásquez was left alone, not only in charge of the project, but also of the work at the clinic.

A superficial analysis would state that the project of Paso Cadena is "nationalized" and that it, under the given circumstances, works well. If we bring in the "indigenization" aspect, however, we may look at it differently. According to the definition of "indigenization", *the project at Paso Cadena is not indigenized!*

This would also explain some of the difficulties that the project has had in connection with:

- a) elevated costs, and
- b) problems of keeping personnel,

as both these types of problem originate from the fact that the project is nominally "nationalized" but not "indigenized".

At Paso Cadena some of the positions are held by indigenous representatives although all of these are outside the project. All administrative positions as regards the community: chief (cacique), elders (líderes) and counsellor/healer (paí) are held by Ava-Chiripá. Thus, the local community

functions, and works well, without external involvement. And the activities have included legal struggle for land (see section on History).

The Norwegian missionaries have found it natural that these Indians continue in their positions - but they have obviously deemed it easier to employ Mestizos in the positions that are inherent in the development project. Those employed have had some education, like Mr. Velásquez and Mrs Verdejo, and it has been possible to introduce them into project activities, and hand over responsibility, in a very short time.

As long as the Norwegian missionaries were able to stay at Paso Cadena and provide them with encouragement, a model for a self-sacrificated life, and some practical assistance, they were able to persist and develop in their positions. When the expatriates had left, this influence was out and, in a very short time Mrs Verdejo decided to leave her position, Mr Velásquez is still at work - but it was evident that he planned to stay for only a limited period.

For a Paraguayan Mestizo, Paso Cadena is far too distant and far too provincial. Work among indigenous groups has a low status in Paraguay and practical problems, such as the education of one's children, jeopardize most excellent intentions and ideological constraints. Therefore, mere "nationalization" is not the ultimate solution to the problem of personnel, nor to the project economy. A Paraguayan Mestizo needs a higher salary to be able to exist at Paso Cadena than he would need at any other place in Paraguay. In comparison to the local Ava-Chiripá, he is very expensive. In comparison to Norwegian missionaries, he is cheaper, but still that difference is not all that big.

Mere "nationalization" of the project therefore implies only slightly lower costs - but considerably diminished rewards: higher inconsistency in ideology, personnel involvement, personnel stability, project effectivity, etc. It is not that the individuals selected by the expatriates should be especially unsuitable - on the contrary, Mr Velásquez is an unusually talented Paraguayan Mestizo that functions surprisingly well in his position - but that the whole set-up is counter-productive.



## 8. RECOMMENDATIONS

### 8.1. Recommended Project Goals for Paso Cadena

On basis of the material presented above, the evaluation team would recommend total "indigenization" of the project at Paso Cadena. As stated elsewhere, this may imply a momentary "regress" as regards "nationalization" as the project will need new expatriates [Norwegian missionaries] during a limited period. We do not consider the present project plans, including mission-trained (Mestizo) nurses to be anything near a final and ultimate solution. Both Mr. Velásquez and the indicated nurses are temporary solutions. Within a few years, the mission will have to find others to replace them.

Considering the cultural distance between the Ava-Chiripá and the surrounding Mestizo society (the gatekeepers), we would recommend the following indigenization level:

- a) that all *socio-economic positions*, now in the hands of the Ava-Chiripá (líderes, cacique and paí), remain so; (the people in these positions should be highly encouraged to go on; e.g. by education provided by the project);
- b) that Ava-Chiripá Indians be *trained to become nurses* (or assistant nurses) at the Paso Cadena community. There is an estimated need of two such nurses. Therefore, according to the principles stated above, at least four should be trained. The Indians trained (men or women) should be resident at Paso Cadena - and preferably married (to avoid migration at marriage). The courses should be held under the surveillance of expatriate personnel, thus avoiding tension between Indians/receivers and the gatekeepers. The courses should be held at Paso Cadena, i.e. with personnel and teachers brought in from the outside, with possible extensions and/or course modules at the nearby hospital. The course should include preventive health care as well as curative medicine and basic pharmacological knowledge.
- c) that Ava-Chiripá Indians be *trained to become elementary school teachers*, teaching first grade at the local school; these should start as teacher's assistants and gradually receive training in a way that the altered status and work conditions are altered as smoothly as possible. We would suggest that practical assistant work (in the beginning sponsored by the project) is intermittently interrupted by theoretical courses. Thus, the Ava-Chiripá students will

after some three to five years, be officially recognized as elementary school teachers.

The advantages with indigenization of these three areas (a-c) are several: (1) *socio-cultural*, (2) *strategical* and (3) *economic*:

### 8.1.1. Socio-cultural advantages

If the Ava-Chiripá Indians are received by people of their own background, representatives of their own community, they will not experience the ethnic barrier that there is today in most occasions where project personnel is involved. This is especially important in the case of the clinic, where a trained Ava-Chiripá may constitute an effective and more frequently consulted alternative to the *paí*. (Today several patients may avoid Western medical treatment for this reason).

The same is true for the school where it is important that the teachers of the first grade (and possible kindergarten) are Ava-Chiripá. If this is the case, the Indians will not be anxious to send their children to school and these will be adapted to the school environment before they are confronted with Mestizo school teachers. (Now, only the handicraft teacher is an Indian, although not an Ava-Chiripá, and that position should also be held by her, or another Indian teacher in the future).

Several of the local authorities should also be engaged as teachers at school, teaching local history, traditions, etc. This should also be combined with the production of school material, primers, readers, etc. and the elaboration of adapted curricula for the different grades. (See comments elsewhere in this report). If enculturation by traditional authorities is included in the school activities, it is possible that resistance towards the school may diminish, and that the negative socio-cultural effects of the school are mitigated somewhat. If this assumption is correct, it implies that the number of drop-outs will diminish notably.

Our suggestion is therefore that four to eight Ava-Chiripá Indians are trained to become assistant (or elementary school) teachers, and that two to four local authorities are incorporated into the teaching activities. Furthermore, the Mestizo teachers should be encouraged to employ Guaraní in their teaching and receive further education in Ava-Chiripá history, traditions and world view.